



MOKELUMNE WATERSHED AVOIDED COST ANALYSIS:

Why Sierra Fuel Treatments Make Economic Sense



Mokelumne Watershed Avoided Cost Analysis: Why Sierra Fuel Treatments Make Economic Sense

Report Version 1.0

April 10, 2014

Citation Suggestion:

Buckley, M., N. Beck, P. Bowden, M. E. Miller, B. Hill, C. Luce, W. J. Elliot, N. Enstice, K. Podolak, E. Winford, S. L. Smith, M. Bokach, M. Reichert, D. Edelson, and J. Gaither. 2014. "Mokelumne watershed avoided cost analysis: Why Sierra fuel treatments make economic sense." A report prepared for the Sierra Nevada Conservancy, The Nature Conservancy, and U.S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service. *Sierra Nevada Conservancy*. Auburn, California. Online: <http://www.sierranevadaconservancy.ca.gov/mokelumne>.

Disclaimer

This report is rich in data and analyses and may help support planning processes in the watershed. The data and analyses were primarily funded with public resources and are therefore available for others to use with appropriate referencing of the sources. This analysis is not intended to be a planning document.

The report includes a section on cultural heritage to acknowledge the inherent value of these resources, while also recognizing the difficulty of placing a monetary value on them. This work honors the value of Native American cultural or sacred sites, or disassociated collected or archived artifacts. This work does not intend to cause direct or indirect disturbance to any cultural resources.

Produced in cooperation with the USDA Forest Service. USDA is an equal opportunity provider and employer.

Contact Information

For More Information:		
 <p>The Nature Conservancy Protecting nature. Preserving life.®</p> <p>David Edelson dedelson@tnc.org</p> <p>Kristen Podolak kpodolak@tnc.org</p>	 <p>SIERRA NEVADA CONSERVANCY</p> <p>Kim Carr kim.carr@sierranevada.ca.gov</p> <p>Nic Enstice nic.enstice@sierranevada.ca.gov</p>	 <p>FOREST SERVICE U S DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE</p> <p>Sherry Hazelhurst shazelhurst@fs.fed.us</p>

Acknowledgements

Project Initiators

Kim Carr – Sustainability Specialist – Sierra Nevada Conservancy

Bruce Goines – Ecosystem Services Leader (Retired) – USDA Forest Service Region 5

Project Manager

Nic Enstice – Senior Regional Program and Policy Analyst – Sierra Nevada Conservancy

Project Funders

Sierra Nevada Conservancy

USDA Forest Service

The Nature Conservancy

Primary Chapter Authors

- Nicole Beck – Principal – 2NDNATURE, LLC
- Matthew Bokach – Ecologist – Forest Service, Region 5
- Philip Bowden – Fuels Manager – Forest Service, Region 5
- Mark Buckley – Senior Economist – ECONorthwest
- David Edelson – Sierra Nevada Project Director – The Nature Conservancy
- Nic Enstice – Senior Regional Program and Policy Analyst – Sierra Nevada Conservancy
- Jim Gaither – Former Eco-regional Ecologist – The Nature Conservancy
- Barry Hill – Regional Hydrologist – Forest Service, Region 5
- Charles Luce – Research Hydrologist – Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station
- Mary Ellen Miller – Michigan Tech Research Institute
- Kristen Podolak – Sierra Nevada Project Associate – The Nature Conservancy
- Mark Reichert – Hydrologist (Retired) – USDA Forest Service
- Sheri Lee Smith – Regional Entomologist – Forest Service, Region 5
- Eric Winford – Environmental Consultant

Project Facilitator

Dorian Fougères

Senior Mediator

Center for Collaborative Policy – California State University, Sacramento

dfougeres@ccp.csus.edu

<http://www.csus.edu/ccp>

Consultants

Mark Buckley

Senior Economist

ECONorthwest

buckley@econw.com

www.econw.com

Nicole Beck, PhD

Principal

2NDNATURE, LLC

nicole@2ndnaturellc.com

<http://www.2ndnaturellc.com/>

Eric Winford

Environmental Consultant – Carbon & Fire

emwinford@gmail.com

Modelers

Fire

Philip Bowden

Fuels Manager

Region 5 – USDA Forest Service

pbowden@fs.fed.us

Joe Scott

Pyrologix LLC

joe.scott@pyrologix.com

Don Yasuda

Regional Analyst, Ecosystem Planning

Region 5 – USDA Forest Service

dyasuda@fs.fed.us

Sediment

William J. Elliot
Research Engineer – Air, Water and Aquatic Environments Science Program
Rocky Mountain Research Station - USDA Forest Service
welliot@fs.fed.us

Barry Hill
Regional Hydrologist
Region 5 – USDA Forest Service
barryhill@fs.fed.us

Charles Luce
Research Engineer – Air, Water and Aquatic Environments Science Program
Rocky Mountain Research Station - USDA Forest Service
cluce@fs.fed.us

Mary Ellen Miller
Research Engineer
Michigan Tech Research Institute
mmaryellen@gmail.com

Mark Reichert
Hydrologist, Retired
USDA Forest Service
mreichert@onemain.com

Jules Riley
Hydrologist – Vegetation Management Solutions Executive Officer
USDA Forest Service
jlriley@fs.fed.us

Copy Editor

Melissa Rowe
ECONorthwest
rowe@econw.com

Cover Design

Danielle DeGarmo
Graphic Designer
Degarmo Creative
dm.degarmo@verizon.net

Document Review

The Advisory and Technical Committee members reviewed this report and provided edits. We would like to especially thank committee members Katherine K. Evatt, R. Winston Bell, and Reuben Childress of Foothill Conservancy for the extra effort they put into reviewing this report.

Cover Photography

Katherine K. Evatt, Foothill Conservancy

Mathew Grimm, Environmental Defense Fund

Noah Berger, EPA

USDA Forest Service

This material is based upon work supported by the Natural Resources Conservation Service, U.S. Department of Agriculture, under number 69-3A75-11-194.

Support Language

Approved October 30, 2013

The Mokelumne Avoided Cost Analysis (MACA) Project is a detailed analytical study intended to inform future forest watershed planning, as well as public and private investment. The focus of the study was the potential avoided costs from fuels reduction treatments in the Mokelumne Watershed. MACA involved a Planning Team, Advisory Committee, Technical Team, and Consultant Team. Each group played a critical role in the process, with the Planning Team ultimately responsible for major project decisions and managing day-to-day project activities; the Advisory Committee providing strategic advice on key decisions and improving the project design and draft analyses; the Technical Team advising on decisions regarding the analytical, modeling, and other technical components of the project; and the Consultant Team taking the lead in developing the analysis. The Advisory Committee met every two to three months, with the Technical Team meeting in between Advisory Committee sessions, the Planning Team meeting bi-weekly, and the Consultant Team having regular interaction with all other groups.

As part of the Advisory Committee, the following managers, executives, and representatives contributed their experience, committed their technical staff, data, information, and, in some cases, committed their organization's resources to support the project. The Advisory Committee partnered with the sponsors on each aspect of the collaborative process, including identifying key issues for analysis; providing strategic advice on key design choices, and feedback on initial work products; developing communication strategies, messages, and materials; sharing key project milestones with their constituencies; and reviewing the draft chapters that constitute this report. The Committee operated under a consensus-seeking decision-making protocol, where each member shared information, sought to understand the range of interests, and worked to develop solutions that met these interests to the maximum extent possible.

The following participants support the findings and conclusions in this report.

- Sierra Nevada Conservancy: Kim Carr and Nic Enstice
- The Nature Conservancy: David Edelson and Kristen Podolak
- Forest Service, Region 5: Bruce Goines, Barry Hill, Philip Bowden, Don Yasuda, and Jeff TenPas
- Amador Calaveras Consensus Group Liaisons: John Hofmann (Amador County), Steve Wilensky (Calaveras County), Kendal Young (USFS)
- Bureau of Land Management: William Haigh and Brian Mulhollen
- California Department of Water Resources: Eric Hong
- California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection: Bill Snyder, Chris Keithley, and Dave Sapsis

- East Bay Municipal Utility District: Richard Leong
- Environmental Defense Fund: Ann Hayden
- Foothill Conservancy: Katherine K. Evatt, R. Winston Bell, Jr., and Reuben Childress
- Forest Service, Eldorado National Forest: Kathy Hardy, Laurence Crabtree, and Rick Hopson
- Forest Service, Stanislaus National Forest: Susan Skalski and Teresa McClung
- Native American representative: Fred Velasquez
- Sierra Pacific Industries: Mark Luster and Tim Tate
- Sustainable Conservation: Kelli McCune and Daniel Mountjoy
- West Point Fire District: Jim Carroll